7.2 The Reasoning of Other Cultures and Past Cultures (p. 169)

How Mistaken Can They Be?

BUT MAYBE THERE'S A limit to how mistaken somebody can be. Gottlob Frege asks us to imagine that we have discovered a tribe whose "laws of thought" contradicted ours, and this even shows up in their actions. These "laws" presumably include the laws of logic (like "If A and B, then A") and the laws of arithmetic (like "2 + 1 = 3"). Who, asks Frege, would be right? Why?¹ Good questions, but we should wonder first if what Frege asks us to imagine is even possible.

¹ The Basic Laws of Arithmetic: Exposition of the System (1893; tr. Montgomery Furth, University of California Press, 1964), p. 14.